FROM EXERCISES 9.1 (Sections 1-1.2)

NOTE: The instructions have been changed from those found in the book.

- Which of the following are analogies?
- Which of the following are analogical arguments?
- If an analogical argument is present, standardize it. Make sure you put it in the correct form of an analogical argument.

1. A rose is a rose is a rose
   Not an analogy.
2. A rose by any other name would smell as sweet.
   Not an analogy.
3. Life is like a bowl of cherries
   An analogy but not an analogical argument.
4. There are more primates in North and South America compared to any other continent.
   Not an analogy.
5. There are not as many primates in North and South America compared to any other continent.
   Not an analogy.
6. Arguments are by nature divisive.
   Not an analogy.
7. I prefer Atlanta whereas my friend prefers Boston.
   Not an analogy.
8. Why are astronomers like boxers? They both see stars.
   An analogy but not an analogical argument.
9. Researchers at Very Cool University (VCU) have been studying the nervous system. They have focused on the nervous systems of crayfish and have learned how to cure disorders of the nervous system in crayfish. In both humans and crayfish, calcium plays a crucial role in the operation of nerves. Their discoveries about the role of calcium in nerve cells of crayfish may lead to important advances in treating such diseases as muscular dystrophy and Alzheimer’s disease.
   (1) Crayfish has nervous systems in which calcium plays a crucial role and we have developed treatments to cure disorders of the nervous system in crayfish.
   (2) Humans also have nervous systems in which calcium plays a crucial role.
   Therefore,
   (3) Humans will probably be helped by the same treatments that help crayfish.
10. The earth and the other planets such as Venus, Mars, Saturn, Jupiter, etc. have several things in common. They are approximately spherical, they revolve around the sun and around their own axis, they follow elliptical orbits, they are large, they have an irregular surface, and they have an atmosphere. The earth contains several forms of life. It is probable that other planets contain several forms of life.
   (1) Earth is approximately spherical, revolves around the sun and around its own axis, follows elliptical orbits, is large, has an irregular surface, has an atmosphere, and
   Earth has life.
(2) Other planets in our solar system also are approximately spherical, revolve around the sun and around their own axis, follow elliptical orbits, are large, have an irregular surface, and have an atmosphere.

Therefore,

(3) Other planets in our solar system probably have life.

11. Monkeys and humans are medium-sized mammals and they live in groups. When monkeys are given substance X, they show reaction R. Consequently, if administered substance X, humans will show reaction R.

(1) Monkeys are medium-sized mammals and they live in groups and if administered substance X, they show reaction R.

(2) Humans also are medium-sized mammals and live in groups. Therefore,

(3) Humans probably will show reaction R if administered substance X.

12. In a New Yorker cartoon, two cats are chatting in front of a badly scratched lounge chair. One says to the other: “I have a couple of other projects I am excited about.”

Not an analogy.

13. A centipede was happy quite,
   Until a frog in fun
   Said, “Pray, which leg comes after which?”
   This raised her mind to such a pitch,
   She lay distracted in the ditch
   Considering how to run
   (Anonymous)

Not an analogy.

14. “There is extensive evidence that permitting people to obtain clean needles will reduce the spread of HIV. An article in the Journal of the American Medical Association stated that needle exchange programs around the world, including Amsterdam, Sweden, Australia, Britain, and several cities in the United States, have led to reduced needle sharing among IDUs, as an increasing percentage of this population obtains clean needles from the program (4). That this should lead to a reduction in HIV infection is to be expected, and there is evidence pointing to that outcome.” (from “The General Effects of Limiting Syringe Availability Within the United States”, http://www.reconsider.org/issues/public_health/aids.htm).

   (1) IDUs with access to needle exchange programs have [a long list of features common to all humans] and they have a lower rate of HIV infection.

   (2) IDUs without access to needle exchange programs have [a long list of features common to all humans].

Therefore,

(3) IDUs without access to needle exchange programs would have lower rates of HIV infection if they had access to needle exchange programs.

15. “Capacity for the nobler feelings is in most natures a very tender plant, easily killed; not only by hostile influences, but by mere want of sustenance; and in the majority of young persons it speedily dies away if the occupations to which their position in life has devoted them, and the society into which it has thrown them, are not favorable to keeping that higher capacity in exercise.” (John Stuart Mill, On Utilitarianism, Hackett, 1979, chapter II, page 10).

An analogy but not an analogical argument.